Asymptotics of the ground state energy for atoms and molecules in the self-generated magnetic field

Victor Ivrii*

December 26, 2011

Problem 1

sect-1

This is a last in the series of three papers (following [17, 18]) and the theorem 1.1 and corollary 1.2 below constitute the final goal of this series. Arguments of this paper are rather standard; all the heavy lifting was done before. Let us consider the following operator (quantum Hamiltonian)

1-1 (1.1)
$$H = \sum_{1 \le j \le N} H_{x_j}^0 + \sum_{1 \le j < k \le N} |x_j - x_k|^{-1}$$

in

11-2 (1.2)
$$\mathfrak{H} = \bigwedge_{1 \leq n \leq N} \mathcal{H}, \qquad \mathcal{H} = \mathcal{L}^2(\mathbb{R}^3, \mathbb{C}^2)$$

with

1-3 (1.3)
$$H^{0} = ((i\nabla - A) \cdot \sigma)^{2} - V(x)$$

Let us assume that

1-4 (1.4) Operator H is self-adjoint on \mathfrak{H} .

^{*}Department of Mathematics, University of Toronto, 40 St. George Street, Toronto, ON, M5S 2E4, Canada, ivrii@math.toronto.edu.

We will never discuss this assumption. We are interested in the *ground state* energy $\mathsf{E}_N^*(A)$ of our system i.e. in the lowest eigenvalue of the operator H on \mathfrak{H} :

as A = 0 and more generally in

1-6 (1.6)
$$\mathsf{E}_{N}^{*} = \inf_{A} \left(\inf \mathsf{Spec}_{\mathfrak{H}} \, \mathsf{H} + \frac{1}{\alpha} \int |\nabla \times A|^{2} \, dx \right)$$

where

1-7 (1.7)
$$V(x) = \sum_{1 \le m \le M} \frac{Z_m}{|x - x_m|}$$

1-8 (1.8)
$$N \approx Z \gg 1$$
, $Z := Z_1 + ... Z_M$, $Z_1 > 0, ..., Z_M > 0$

M is fixed, under assumption

1-9 (1.9)
$$0 < \alpha \le \kappa^* Z^{-1}$$

with sufficiently small constant $\kappa^* > 0$.

Our purpose is to prove

thm-1-1 Theorem 1.1. Under assumption $(\stackrel{|1-9}{1.9})$ as $N \ge Z - CZ^{-\frac{2}{3}}$

1-10 (1.10)
$$\mathsf{E}_{N}^{*} = \mathcal{E}_{N}^{\mathsf{TF}} + \sum_{1 \leq m \leq M} 2Z_{m}^{2}S(\alpha Z_{m}) + O(N^{\frac{16}{9}} + \alpha a^{-3}N^{2})$$

provided

1-11 (1.11)
$$a := \min_{1 \le m < m' \le M} |\mathsf{x}_m - \mathsf{x}_{m'}| \ge N^{-\frac{1}{3}}$$

where $\mathcal{E}_N^{\mathsf{TF}}$ is a Thomas-Fermi energy (see [LI] or [IS]) and $S(Z_m)Z_m^2$ are magnetic Scott correction terms (see [EFS3] or [IS]).

Combining with the properties of the Thomas-Fermi energy we arrive to

cor-1-2 Corollary 1.2. Let us consider $x_m = x_m^0$ minimizing full energy

1-12 (1.12)
$$\mathsf{E}_N^* + \sum_{1 \le m < m' \le M} Z_m Z_{m'} |\mathsf{x}_m - \mathsf{x}_{m'}|^{-1}.$$

Assume that

$$\boxed{\mathbf{1-13}} \quad (1.13) \qquad \qquad Z_m \asymp N \qquad \forall m = 1, \dots, M.$$

Then $a \geq N^{-\frac{1}{4}}$ and the remainder estimate in $(\stackrel{|1-10}{|1.10})$ is $O(N^{\frac{16}{9}})$.

rem-1-3 Remark 1.3. As $\alpha = 0$ the remainder estimate $(\stackrel{1-12}{1.12})$ was proven in $\stackrel{[ivrii:ground]}{[IS]}$ and the remainder estimate $O(N^{\frac{5}{3}}(N^{-\delta} + a^{-\delta}))$ in $\stackrel{[FS]}{[FS]}$ for atoms (M = 1) and $\stackrel{[I2]}{[I2]}$ for $M \geq 1$; this better asymptotics contains also Dirac and Schwinger correction terms. Unfortunately I was not able to recover such remainder estimate here unless α satisfies stronger assumption than $(\stackrel{[I.9]}{[I.9]})$. I still hope to achieve this better estimate without extra assumptions.

Recall that Thomas-Fermi potential W^{TF} and Thomas-Fermi density ρ^{TF} satisfy equations

1-14 (1.14)
$$\rho^{\mathsf{TF}} = \frac{1}{3\pi^2} (W^{\mathsf{TF}})^{\frac{3}{2}}$$

and

1-15 (1.15)
$$W^{\mathsf{TF}} = V^0 + \frac{1}{4\pi} |x|^{-1} * \rho^{\mathsf{TF}}.$$

We prove theorem 1.1 in sections 2 "Lower estimate" and 3.2 "Upper Estimate". Section 4 "Miscellaneous" is devoted to corollary 1.2 and a brief discussion.

2 Lower estimate

sect-2

Consider corresponding to H quadratic form

$$\begin{array}{ccc} \mathbf{2-1} & (2.1) & \langle \mathsf{H}\Psi, \Psi \rangle = \sum_{j} (H_{x_{j}}^{0}\Psi, \Psi) + (\sum_{1 \leq j < k \leq N} |x_{j} - x_{k}|^{-1}\Psi, \Psi) = \\ & \sum_{j} (H_{x_{j}}\Psi, \Psi) + ((V - W)\Psi, \Psi) + (\sum_{1 \leq j < k \leq N} |x_{j} - x_{k}|^{-1}\Psi, \Psi) \end{array}$$

with

$$\mathbf{2-2} \quad (2.2) \qquad \qquad H = \left((i\nabla - \mathbf{A}) \cdot \boldsymbol{\sigma} \right)^2 - W(x)$$

where we select W later. By Lieb-Oxford inequality the last term is estimated from below:

$$(2.3) \qquad \langle \sum_{1 \le j < k \le N} |x_j - x_k|^{-1} \Psi, \Psi \rangle \ge \mathsf{D}(\rho_{\Psi}, \rho_{\Psi}) - C \int \rho_{\Psi}^{\frac{4}{3}} dx$$

where

$$\rho_{\Psi}(x) = N \int |\Psi(x; x_2, ..., x_N)|^2 dx_2 \cdots dx_N$$

is a spatial density associated with Ψ and

2-5 (2.5)
$$\mathsf{D}(\rho, \rho') := \frac{1}{2} \iint |x - y|^{-1} \rho(x) \rho'(y) \, dx dy$$

Therefore

2-6 (2.6)
$$\langle \mathsf{H}\Psi, \Psi \rangle \ge$$

$$\sum_{j} (H_{x_{j}}\Psi, \Psi) - 2((V - W)\Psi, \Psi) + \mathsf{D}(\rho_{\Psi}, \rho_{\Psi}) - C \int \rho_{\Psi}^{\frac{4}{3}} dx =$$

$$\sum_{j} (H_{x_{j}}\Psi, \Psi) - 2\mathsf{D}(\rho, \rho_{\Psi}) + \mathsf{D}(\rho_{\Psi}, \rho_{\Psi}) - C \int \rho_{\Psi}^{\frac{4}{3}} dx =$$

$$\sum_{j} (H_{x_{j}}\Psi, \Psi) - \mathsf{D}(\rho, \rho) + \mathsf{D}(\rho - \rho_{\Psi}, \rho - \rho_{\Psi}) - C \int \rho_{\Psi}^{\frac{4}{3}} dx$$

as

$$[2-7]$$
 (2.7) $W - V = |x|^{-1} * \rho.$

Note that due to antisymmetry of Ψ

$$\sum_{j} (H_{x_j} \Psi, \Psi) \ge \sum_{1 \le j \le N: \lambda_j < 0} \lambda_j \ge \operatorname{Tr}^-(H)$$

where λ_i are eigenvalues of H.

To estimate the last term in (2.6) we reproduce the proof of Lemma 4.3from [ES3]:

According to magnetic Lieb-Thirring inequality for $U \geq 0$:

2-9 (2.9)
$$\sum_{j \le N} \langle (H_{x_j}^0 - U) \Psi, \Psi \rangle \ge -C \int U^{5/2} dx - C \gamma^{-3} U^4 dx - \gamma \int B^2 dx$$

 $\mathsf{B} = \nabla \times \mathsf{A}, \ \gamma > 0$ is arbitrary. Selecting $U = \beta \min(\rho_{\Psi}^{5/3}, \gamma \rho_{\Psi}^{4/3})$ with $\beta > 0$ small but independent from γ we ensure $\frac{1}{2}U\rho_{\Psi} \geq CU^{5/2} + C\gamma^{-3}U^4$ and then

which implies

$$\begin{array}{ll} \boxed{\textbf{2-11}} & (2.11) & \int \rho_{\Psi}^{4/3} dx \leq \gamma^{-1} \int \min \bigl(\rho_{\Psi}^{5/3}, \gamma \rho^{4/3} \bigr) dx + \gamma \int \rho_{\Psi} dx \leq \\ & c \gamma^{-1} \sum_{j: \lambda_{i} < 0} \left\langle (H_{x_{j}}^{0}) \Psi, \Psi \right\rangle + c \int \mathsf{B}^{2} dx + c \gamma \mathsf{N} \end{array}$$

where we use $\int \rho_{\Psi} dx = N$.

rem-2-1 Remark 2.1. As one can prove easily (see also ES3) that

$$\sum_{i \le N} \langle (H_{x_i}^0) \Psi, \Psi \rangle \le C Z^{\frac{4}{3}} N$$

we conclude that

2-13 (2.13)
$$\int \rho_{\Psi}^{4/3} dx \le CZ^{\frac{2}{3}} N + C_1 \int \mathsf{B}^2 dx.$$

It is sufficient unless we want to recover Dirac-Schwinger terms which unfortunately are too far away for us.

Therefore skipping the non-negative third term in the right-hand expression of (2.6) we conclude that

Applying Theorem 5.2 from 18 we conclude that

 $(2.15)_{14}$ the sum of the first and the second terms in the right-hand expression of (2.14) is greater than

$$\frac{2}{15\pi^2}\int W^{\frac{5}{2}}\,dx + \sum_m 2Z_m^2 S(\alpha Z_m) - CN^{\frac{16}{9}} - C\alpha a^{-3}N^2.$$

To prove this estimate one needs just to rescale $x \mapsto xN^{\frac{1}{3}}$, $a \mapsto aN^{\frac{1}{3}}$ and introduce $h = N^{-\frac{1}{3}}$ and $\kappa = \alpha N$. Here one definitely needs the regularity properties like in [18] but we have them as $\rho = \rho^{\mathsf{TF}}$, $W = W^{\mathsf{TF}}$. Also one can see easily that " $-C_1$ " brings correction not exceeding $C_2 \alpha N^2$ as $\alpha N \leq 1$. Meanwhile for $\rho = \rho^{\mathsf{TF}}$, $W = W^{\mathsf{TF}}$

$$\frac{2}{15\pi^2} \int W^{\frac{5}{2}} dx - D(\rho, \rho) = \mathcal{E}^{\mathsf{TF}}.$$

Lower estimate of Theorem 1.1 has been proven.

rem-2-2 Remark 2.2. $\rho = \rho^{\mathsf{TF}}$, $W = W^{\mathsf{TF}}$ delivers the maximum of the right-hand expression of (2.16) among ρ , W satisfying (2.7).

3 Upper Estimate

Upper estimate is easy. Plugging as Ψ the Slater determinant (see [IS] f.e.) of ψ_1, \dots, ψ_N where ψ_1, \dots, ψ_N are eigenfunctions of $H_{A,W}$ we get

3-1 (3.1)
$$\langle \mathsf{H}\Psi, \Psi \rangle = \mathsf{Tr}^{-}(H_{A,W} - \lambda_N) + \lambda_N N + \int (W - V)(x) \rho_{\Psi}(x) \, dx + \mathsf{D}(\rho_{\Psi}, \rho_{\Psi}) - \frac{1}{2} N(N-1) \iint |x_1 - x_2|^{-1} |\Psi(x_1, x_2; x_3, \dots, x_N)|^2 \, dx_1 \cdots dx_N$$

where we don't care about last term as we drop it (again because we cannot get sharp enough estimate) and the first term in the second line is in fact

3-2 (3.2)
$$-2D(\rho, \rho_{\Psi});$$
 provided (2.7) holds. Thus we get

3-3 (3.3)
$$\operatorname{Tr}^{-}(H_{A,W} - \lambda_{N}) + \lambda_{N}N - \operatorname{D}(\rho, \rho) + \operatorname{D}(\rho_{\Psi} - \rho, \rho_{\Psi} - \rho) + \frac{1}{\kappa} \int |\partial A|^{2} dx$$

where we added magnetic energy. Definitely we have several problems here: λ_N depends on A and there may be less than N negative eigenvalues.

However in the latter case we can obviously replace N by the lesser number $\bar{N} := \max(n \leq N_n \lambda_n \leq 0)$ as E_N^* is decreasing function of N. In this case the first term in (3.3) would be just $Tr^{-}(H_{A,W})$ and the second would be 0. Then we apply theory of [18] immediately without extra complications.

Consider A a minimizer (or its mollification) for potential $W = W^{TF}$ and $\mu \leq 0$. Then with an error $O(N^{\frac{2}{3}})$

3-4 (3.4)
$$\#\{\lambda_k < \mu\} = \int (W - \mu)_+^{\frac{3}{2}} dx + O(N^{\frac{2}{3}}).$$

One can prove $(3.4)^{3-4}$ easily using the regularity properties of A established in $\frac{18}{18}$ and the same rescaling as before. Note that the first term in (3.4)differs from the same expression with $\mu = 0$ (which is equal to Z) by $\simeq \mu(N^{4/3})^{1/2} \cdot N^{-1} = \mu N^{-1/3}$. Then as the left-hand expression equals N, and $N - Z = O(N^{\frac{2}{3}})$, we conclude that $|\lambda_N| = O(N)$.

Therefore modulo $O(N^{\frac{16}{9}} + \kappa a^{-3}N^2)$ the sum of the first and the last term in (3.3) is equal to

3-5 (3.5)
$$\frac{2}{15\pi^2} \int (W - \lambda_N)_+^{\frac{5}{2}} dx + \sum_m 2Z_m^2 S(\kappa Z_m)$$

and modulo $O(N^{-\frac{1}{3}}\lambda_N^2) = O(N^{\frac{5}{3}})$ one can rewrite the first term here as

$$\frac{2}{15\pi^2} \int W_+^{\frac{5}{2}} dx - \lambda_N \frac{1}{3\pi^2} \int W_+^{\frac{3}{2}} dx$$

and with the same error the second term here cancels term $\lambda_N N$ in $(\stackrel{3-3}{3.3})$; then (3.3) becomes

3-7 (3.7)
$$\frac{2}{15\pi^2} \int W_+^{\frac{5}{2}} dx + \sum_m 2Z_m^2 S(\kappa Z_m) - D(\rho, \rho) + D(\rho_{\Psi} - \rho, \rho_{\Psi} - \rho)$$

and as $W = W^{\mathsf{TF}}$, $\rho = \rho^{\mathsf{TF}}$ the first and the third term together are $\mathcal{E}^{\mathsf{TF}}$, so we get again $\mathcal{E}^{\mathsf{TF}} + \sum_{m} 2Z_{m}^{2}S(\kappa Z_{m})$. Now we need to estimate properly the last term in (3.7) i.e.

3-8 (3.8)
$$\frac{1}{2} \iint |x-y|^{-1} (\rho_{\Psi}(x) - \rho^{\mathsf{TF}}(x)) (\rho_{\Psi}(y) - \rho^{\mathsf{TF}}(y)) \, dx dy.$$

Rescaling as before, and using (1.14) we conclude that it does not exceed

3-9 (3.9)
$$N^{\frac{5}{3}} \iint \varrho(x)^2 \varrho(y)^2 \ell^{-1}(x) \ell^{-1}(y) |x-y|^{-1} dx dy$$

where ϱ is ρ of [18] and we know that $\varrho = \ell^{-\frac{1}{2}}$ as $\ell \leq 1$ and $\varrho = \ell^{-2}$ as $\ell \geq 1$. Estimating integral by the (double) sum of integral as $\ell(x) \leq 1$, $\ell(y) \leq 1$ and $\ell(x) \geq 1$, $\ell(y) \geq 1$ we get (increasing C)

$$C\int_{\{|y|\leq |x|\leq 1\}} |x-y|^{-1}|x|^{-2}|y|^{-2}\,dydx \approx 1$$

and

$$C\int_{\{|y|\geq |x|\geq 1\}} |x-y|^{-1}|x|^{-3}|y|^{-3} dydx \approx 1$$

respectively.

This concludes the proof of the upper estimate in Theorem 1.1 which is proven now.

4 Miscellaneous

sect-4

Proof. Proof of corollary 1.2 Optimization with respect to x_1, \dots, x_M implies

where $\mathsf{E}^* = \mathsf{E}^*(\mathsf{x}_1,\dots,\mathsf{x}_M;Z_1,\dots,Z_m,N)$ and $\mathsf{E}^*_{-1} = \mathsf{E}^*_{-1}(Z_m,Z_m)$ are calculated for separate atoms. In virtue of theorem 1.1 and (1.9) then

4-2 (4.2)
$$\mathcal{E}^{\mathsf{TF}} - \sum_{1 \le m \le M} \mathcal{E}_m^{\mathsf{TF}} \le C a^{-3} N + C N^{\frac{16}{9}};$$

however due to strong non-binding theorem in Thomas-Fermi theory (see f.e. [S]) the left-hand expression is $\approx a^{-7}$ as $a \geq N^{-\frac{1}{3}}$ and therefore (4.2) implies

4-3 (4.3)
$$a \ge \epsilon_1 N^{-\frac{16}{21}}$$

and $a^{-3}N \leq N^{\frac{16}{9}}$.

On the other hand, there is no binding with $a \leq N^{-\frac{1}{3}}$ because remainder estimate is (better than) CN^2 and binding energy excess is $\approx N^{\frac{7}{3}}$.

rem-4-1 Remark 4.1. Similar arguments work if we improve $N^{\frac{16}{9}}$ to N^{ν} with $\nu \geq \frac{7}{4}$ but without improving $a^{-3}N$ part of the remainder estimate we would not pass beyond $O(N^{\frac{7}{4}})$.

There are several questions which after [18] could be answered in this framework by the standard arguments with certain error but we postpone it, hoping to improve remainder estimate $O(h^{-\frac{4}{3}})$ in [18]:

problem-4-2 Problem 4.2. (i) Investigate case $N \leq Z - CZ^{\frac{2}{3}}$;

- (ii) Estimate from above excess negative charge (how many extra electrons can and bind atom) ionization energy $(\mathsf{E}_{N-1}^* \mathsf{E}_N^*)$;
- (iii) Estimate from above excess positive charge in the case of binding of several atoms i.e. estimate Z-N as

Bibliography

- M. Bronstein, M., V. Ivrii Sharp Spectral Asymptotics for Operators with Irregular Coefficients. Pushing the Limits. Comm. Partial Differential Equations, 28, 1&2:99–123 (2003).
 - EFS1 [EFS1] L. Erdős, S. Fournais, J.P. Solovej: Stability and semiclassics in self-generated fields. arXiv:1105.0506
 - EFS2 [EFS2] L. Erdős, S. Fournais, J.P. Solovej: Second order semiclassics with self-generated magnetic fields. arXiv:http://arxiv.org/abs/1105.0512
 - [EFS3] L. Erdős, S. Fournais, J.P. Solovej: Scott correction for large atoms and molecules in a self-generated magnetic field arXiv:1105.0521
 - [ES3] [ES3] L. Erdős, J.P. Solovej: Ground state energy of large atoms in a self-generated magnetic field arXiv:0903.1816 Commun. Math. Phys. 294, No. 1, 229-249 (2009)
 - [FS] C. Fefferman and L.A. Seco: On the energy of a large atom, Bull. AMS 23, 2, 525–530 (1990).
 - [FSW1] R. L. Frank, H. Siedentop, S. Warzel: The ground state energy of heavy atoms: relativistic lowering of the leading energy correction. Commun. Math. Phys. 278 no. 2, 549–566 (2008)

- FSW2 [FSW2] R. L. Frank, H. Siedentop, S. Warzel: The energy of heavy atoms according to Brown and Ravenhall: the Scott correction. Doc. Math. 14, 463–516 (2009).
- FLL [FLL] J. Fröhlich, E. H. Lieb, and M. Loss: Stability of Coulomb systems with magnetic fields. I. The one-electron atom. Commun. Math. Phys. 104 251–270 (1986)
 - [H] W. Hughes: An atomic energy bound that gives Scott's correction, Adv. Math. **79**, 213–270 (1990).
- ivrii:MQT-Vishik [I1] V. Ivrii, Heavy molecules in the strong magnetic field. Russian Journal of Math. Phys., 4(1):29-74 (1996).
 - V. Ivrii Asymptotics of the ground state energy of heavy molecules in the strong magnetic field. I. Russian Journal of Mathematical Physics, 4(1):29–74 (1996).
 - V. Ivrii Asymptotics of the ground state energy of heavy molecules in the strong magnetic field. II. Russian Journal of Mathematical Physics, 5(3):321–354 (1997).
 - ivrii:book [I4] V. Ivrii Microlocal Analysis and Precise Spectral Asymptotics, Springer-Verlag, 1998.
 - V. Ivrii Sharp spectral asymptotics for operators with irregular coefficients. Pushing the limits. II. Comm. Part. Diff. Equats., 28 (1&2):125–156, (2003).
 - futurebook [I6] V. Ivrii Microlocal Analysis and Sharp Spectral Asymptotics, in progress: available online at http://www.math.toronto.edu/ivrii/futurebook.pdf
 - MQT10 [I7] V. Ivrii Local trace asymptotics in the self-generated magnetic field, arXiv:math/1108.4188 [math.AP]:1-24, 09/2011
 - MQT11 [I8] V. Ivrii Global trace asymptotics in the self-generated magnetic field in the case of Coulomb-like singularities, arXiv:math/1112.2487 [math.AP]:1-21, 12/2011.
 - ivrii:ground [IS] V. Ivrii and , I. M. Sigal Asymptotics of the ground state energies of large Coulomb systems. Ann. of Math., 138:243–335 (1993).

- Lieb-1 [L1] E. H. Lieb: Thomas-Fermi and related theories of atoms and molecules, Rev. Mod. Phys. **65**. No. 4, 603-641 (1981)
- Lieb-2 [L2] E. H. Lieb: Variational principle for many-fermion systems, Phys. Rev. Lett. 46, 457–459 (1981) and 47 69(E) (1981)
 - [LLS] [LLS] E. H. Lieb, M. Loss and J. P. Solovej: Stability of Matter in Magnetic Fields, Phys. Rev. Lett. 75, 985–989 (1995).
 - [LO] E. H. Lieb and S. Oxford: Improved Lower Bound on the Indirect Coulomb Energy, Int. J. Quant. Chem. 19, 427–439, (1981)
 - Sol [S] J. P. Solovej Asymptotic neutrality of diatomic molecules, Commun. Math. Phys., **130**, 185-204, 1990.